BOOK REVIEW

The Coddling of the American Mind
by Greg Lukianoff and Jonathan Haidt
Reviewed by Mark Harbour, CPA, CFA®, CIMA®
The Coddling of the American Mind: How Good Intentions and Bad Ideas Are Setting up a Generation for Failure

By Greg Lukianoff and Jonathan Haidt

Reviewed by Mark Harbour, CPA, CFA®, CIMA®

In many levels, our society and culture seem more polarized, opinionated, and increasingly oriented toward disruption and discredit than the constructive pursuit of consensus and common ground. Identifying actions that will promote tolerance and constructive dialogue, rather than continued character assassinations and polarized thinking, would seem to be a timely exertion.

In 2015, authors Greg Lukianoff and Jonathan Haidt published their article, “The Coddling of the American Mind,” in The Atlantic.¹ They argued that many parents, K-12 teachers, and university professors and administrators have been unknowingly teaching a generation of students to engage in the mental habits common to people who suffer from anxiety and depression. They call this “vindictive protectiveness” and argued that the resulting behaviors make it difficult to have open discussions in which participants can practice the essential skills of critical thinking and civil disagreement. Their definition of “coddling” for this purpose means “overprotecting.”

By 2016, Lukianoff and Haidt were noticing these practices and behaviors at universities in the United Kingdom, Canada, and Australia, too. So they decided to take a deeper dive into the questions they had raised, do additional research, and incorporate the results into a book.

The book has four sections, and the first (chapters 1 through 3) describes three bad ideas, summarized in table 1.

Section two (chapters 4 and 5) describes situations that emerge when people apply the bad ideas. The authors cite several examples, a couple of which you may recall:

- The violent protest catalyzed by a speech by Milo Yiannopoulos at the University of California, Berkeley in February 2017, which protesters aimed to prevent from happening. Attacks on individuals and property resulted in damage estimated at more than $500,000.

Events at Evergreen State College, located south of Seattle, Washington, where Professor Bret Weinstein wrote a letter to the faculty opposing plans to extend the college’s traditional “Day of Absence,” during which minority staff, faculty, and students voluntarily avoid campus, to include white members of the community. Resulting protests led to Weinstein and Professor Heather Heying, his wife, resigning from Evergreen and receiving a $500,000 settlement with the school.

Section three (chapters 6 through 11) describes specific research into aspects of current parenting and teaching that have led to the erosion of critical thinking skills. The authors cite six interacting “threads” that they suggest explain the perspective shifts that have occurred in the “internet generation” or “iGen,” also known as Generation Z:

1. Rising political polarization, cross-party animosity, and negative partisanship. The authors describe how, during the Great Depression and two world wars, there was relative internal unity toward external challenges. But since that time, the larger community has splintered over “tribal” issues, and evolution within the media has fostered this (e.g., no longer does everyone watch one of the “big three” network news programs). Lukianoff and Haidt point to two pieces of research to support their claim:

   "No one would talk much in society if they knew how often they misunderstood others."
   —Johann Wolfgang von Goethe

© 2019 Investments & Wealth Institute, formerly IMCA. Reprinted with permission. All rights reserved.
Three Bad Ideas

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Psychological Principle</th>
<th>Wisdom</th>
<th>Great Untruth (i.e., bad idea)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Young people are antifragile.</td>
<td>Prepare the child for the road, not the road for the child.</td>
<td>What doesn’t kill you makes you weaker.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>We are all prone to emotional reasoning and the confirmation bias.*</td>
<td>Your worst enemy cannot harm you as much as your own thoughts, unguarded. But once mastered, no one can help you as much, not even your father or your mother.</td>
<td>Always trust your feelings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>We are all prone to dichotomous thinking and tribalism.</td>
<td>The line dividing good and evil cuts through the heart of every human being.</td>
<td>Life is a battle between good people and evil people.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* “The tendency to search for, interpret, favor, and recall information in a way that confirms one’s preexisting beliefs or hypotheses.” As noted in Scott Plous, The Psychology of Judgment and Decision Making (1993, p. 235).

A Pew Research Center survey that compared perspectives about policy issues in order to identify differences based on party affiliation, race, religious attendance, education, age, and gender. The research found that, from 2004 to 2017, the distance between perspectives based on party affiliation has more than doubled (i.e., from 17 points to 36 points). The differences based on the other factors have remained relatively stable.

An American National Election Study that indicates that Americans’ feelings toward their own parties have not changed much since the late 1970s. However, since the mid-1990s, ratings of the other party have become increasingly hostile.

2. Rising levels of teen anxiety, depression, and suicide. The authors cite research from Jean Twenge that points out the following:

- Kids now grow up more slowly; activities that mark the transition from childhood to adulthood are happening later; 18-year-olds act like 15-year-olds and 13-year-olds act like 10-year-olds. Kids spend less time interacting face-to-face and more time alone interacting with screens.
- A rapid rise (since 2012) in adolescent depression rates, especially among girls, and a rise (since 2007) in suicide and attempted suicide among teens 15–19 years of age.
- Since 2012, the percentage of female college students who responded yes to having a psychological disorder increased from 6 percent to more than 14 percent. The number for males went from 3 percent to just more than 6 percent.

3. An increase in “paranoid” parenting practices—a trend toward overprotective parenting that inadvertently stunts children’s growth by depriving them of experiences they need to become functioning, successful adults. In other words, protecting kids from risk by preventing them from gaining experience comes with costs: Kids miss out on opportunities to learn skills, independence, and risk assessment.

4. The decline of free play, which helps children develop skills of cooperation and dispute resolution closely related to the “art of association” that democracies depend upon. Put another way, the trend toward regimented activity has made the emerging generation less able to work out the ordinary conflicts of daily life.

5. The growth of campus bureaucracy, a “culture of vulnerability,” and a “victim culture” on campus. Examples include the following:

- College administrators warning students not to talk about self-destructive or suicidal thoughts because it would make others feel uncomfortable—in an effort to avoid negative publicity and threats of litigation.

- Creation of vague and overbroad speech codes (e.g., University of Connecticut banned “inappropriately directed laughter.”) “Free speech zones” have restricted certain kinds of speech and expression to tiny and often remote parts of campus.

6. The authors suggest that political events during 2012–2018 have been as emotionally powerful as those of the late 1960s and are triggering social justice activism on both the political left and right.

Section four (chapters 12, 13, and the conclusion) points to remedies:

1. Chapter 12 references specific steps and resources for improving the experiences of children.

- Six categories are mentioned, each with steps to offset negative impacts. The first three contain practical ways to expose children to risk-taking, by building their interpersonal skills, and engaging in “constructive disagreement” (i.e., arguments can be enlightening and aren’t necessarily destructive).
- Suggestions for involvement with school systems to update how kids are educated to enhance recess with less active supervision.
- A new national norm that encourages kids to take at least a year to either work or perform service before attending college, away from home if possible.
2. Chapter 13 provides specific suggestions that institutions of higher education can take to become “wiser universities.”

- Universities can endorse or adopt the Chicago Statement, which details a commitment to free expression as a vital aspect of academic purpose, and ban the “heckler’s veto” from campus. Both demonstrate a commitment to free expression.

- Enhance selection criteria to broaden the student-body age base and select students from schools more active in teaching intellectual virtues. Include “viewpoint” diversity in all policies to help ensure that a broad range of perspectives will be included in the dialogue.

- Orient and educate for productive disagreement—reject fragility due to emotions, reject emotional reasoning, and reject “us versus them” (i.e., everyone fits into either the good category or bad category).

3. The concluding chapter hints at suggestions that would encourage a “wiser society.” The authors mention possible improvements in social media and cite recent moves to hire social psychologists as a potential path to changes for the better. As well, they mention Utah’s adoption of a “free-range parenting” law, and emerging research in identity politics aimed at countering tribalism as steps in the right direction.

**ENDNOTES**


8. They cite Lenore Skenazy (see endnote 5); https://letgrow.org, a website organized by Skenazy and cofounded with Jonathan Haidt, Peter Gray, and Daniel Shuchman; Robert Leahy, The Worry Cure: Seven Steps to Stop Worry from Stopping You (Harmony, 2006); and Tamar Chansky, Freeing Your Child From Anxiety: Powerful, Practical Solutions to Overcome Your Child’s Fears, Worries, and Phobias (Harmony, 2004).


10. A heckler’s veto is an impermissible content-based restriction on speech where the speech is prohibited due to an anticipated disorderly or violent reaction of the audience, www.duhaime.org.

11. Utah S.B. 65 redefines the state’s definition of “neglect” so that kids can participate in some unsupervised activities without their parents being charged. The bill was signed into law on March 15, 2019, https://le.utah.gov/2018/bills/static/5B0865.html.

---

The Coddling of the American Mind by Greg Lukianoff and Jonathan Haidt

Penguin Press, 2018

352 pages, $18.99, hardback